



**Implementing the UN Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy in Central Asia**  
**3<sup>rd</sup> Expert Meeting Addressing Pillar III of the Strategy**  
**co-organized by the CTITF, UNRCCA and the EU**  
**co-financed by the Government of Norway**  
**With the support of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Kazakhstan**  
**July 21-22, 2011 in Almaty, Kazakhstan**  
**FINAL REPORT<sup>1</sup>**

The Third Expert Meeting of the project on the implementation of the UN Global Counter-terrorism (CT) Strategy in Central Asia (CA) took place in Almaty, Kazakhstan on July 21-22, 2011. The meeting was co-organized by the CTITF, EU (EEAS) and conducted by the UNRCCA, with the support of the host government of Kazakhstan and financial support from the EU (EEAS) and the Government of Norway.

The goal of the third and last Expert Meeting was to provide a platform for sharing experiences, to explore mutual cooperation among CA countries, identify best practices and gaps in their efforts towards countering terrorism, and to gather concrete recommendations on Pillar III of the UN Global CT Strategy for the Joint Action Plan for the Implementation of the Strategy in Central Asia. It brought together 61 representatives of:

- Governments of four Central Asian countries (Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan and Turkmenistan) represented through representatives of Ministries of Foreign Affairs, National Security Committees, Prosecutor General's Offices and Ministries of Interior;
- Representatives of states of the region and other countries (Afghanistan, China, Iran, Norway, Pakistan, Russian Federation, Turkey and the US);
- Representatives of regional and international organizations (CARICC, CICA, CIS, CSTO, INTERPOL, OSCE, ODIHR, RCTS SCO and SCO);
- Representatives of EU (EU and EEAS and EU SRCA);
- Representatives of UN organizations and CTITF entities (CTED, DPA, DPI, DPKO, ESCAP, UNHCR, UNODC, UN RC/UNDP, UNRCCA, UN SC 1267 Committee Expert and UN SC 1540 Committee Expert).

---

<sup>1</sup> This Report has been compiled by Shahrbanou Tadjbakhsh, Consultant of the Project, with the help of the rapporteurs Nodir Khudayberganov (UNRCCA Uzbekistan) and Jomart Ormonbekov (UNRCCA Kyrgyzstan) with input from Anne Wu (CTITF Office), Marc Bojanic (UNRCCA), Milana Lickova (EU) and the moderators of the Working Sessions: Dolgor Solongo (UNODC), Toktasyn Buzubaev (CIS), Beksultan Sarsekov (CARICC) and László Szűcs (OSCE) as well as input by all participants of the Almaty Meeting including written contributions from INTERPOL, OSCE, CIS, RCTS SCO and CSTO.

## **Executive Summary**

### **Session 1: State Capacity to Prevent and Combat Terrorism**

- Capacity building is needed for States to be able to implement all the pillars of the Global CT Strategy. This includes addressing conditions conducive to the spread of terrorism (Pillar I) through overcoming adverse socio-economic conditions, social exclusion and marginalization as well as ideological battles that contribute to radicalization. It also includes capacity building to ensure respect for human rights and the rule of law, including good governance, in their efforts to counter terrorism (Pillar IV).
- A survey is needed to map the capacity building work already done in CA which will help identify priority areas including needs and gaps to guide future capacity building projects.
- Institutional capacity needs to be enhanced for the security sector, including improving border management and law enforcement through technical assistance for equipment, hardware, staff training and specialized knowledge. Cooperation and coordination mechanisms between agencies with the involvement of all relevant ministries need to be put in place and strengthened.
- The capacity of the criminal justice systems of Central Asian States, including training for investigators and prosecutors, and the mutual study of CT legislation and its approximation, should be enhanced to enable them to properly prosecute terrorists suspects.
- Specific capacity building initiatives should be considered for specialized areas such as Anti-Money Laundering/Counter-Financing of Terrorism (AML/CFT), countering the use of the Internet for terrorist purposes and capacity building in the CBRN area.
- A regional CA system for biometric identities, on the model of that being introduced in Tajikistan through an OSCE/INTERPOL Project should be considered by donors.

### **Session 2: The Role of Regional Organizations in Addressing State Capacity**

- Regional organizations should consider adopting their own holistic CT strategies and programs, on the basis of the UN Global CT Strategy.
- The Regional Action Plan to implement the UN Global CT Strategy in CA

should be the strategic and operational platform under which regional organizations build consensus and coordinate their efforts to strengthen the institutional counterterrorism capacities of CA states. Relevant regional and international organizations should create a formal Working Group which would be responsible for supporting States implement the Regional Action Plan and monitor progress made under the aegis of the UN.

- Mapping should be conducted on how the activities of regional organizations are contributing to the implementation of the UN Global CT Strategy. This information, as well as information on progress made by States towards the implementation of the Regional Action Plan, should be presented in a consolidated website for the region, which UNRCCA should consider creating.
- A unified guidebook for mutual definitions on terrorism and related acts (an alphabetical thematic dictionary) should be considered.
- The institutional capacity of the Anti-Terrorism Units or Center of Regional organizations need to be strengthened with more resources, sustained engagement and political support, so as to boost their capacities to provide assistance, monitor progress and assist with implementation of international and regional counter-terrorism commitments.
- Participants proposed the opening of a Central Asian Counter-Terrorism Center, dedicated to education and training, including creation of specific programs for rural youth.
- Formal and informal networks for capacity building among regional bodies, between them and international organizations as well as cross-regional cooperation should be facilitated by the UN and other international organizations.
- Enhanced cooperation with national actors and civil society should be encouraged, in order to ensure sustainability of projects and ensure local ownership of their programs.

### **Session 3: Strengthening the Role of UN System on Building State Capacity to Prevent and Combat Terrorism**

- Systematic organization of roundtables, workshops, trainings and platforms for dialogue are necessary by the UN entities in order to identify needs and to help countries apply universal standards in their CT initiatives as well as to help implement relevant UN legislation. CTITF could also support Member States in developing their national CT strategies, where possible.
- CTITF and the UN System as a whole should continue to offer capacity support directly or through facilitating match-making between requests and offers of assistance, bearing in mind that better synchronization and closer integration of efforts is necessary for effective support. The SC Committees and the experts

groups that support them could also be approached for help in the preparation of assessment reports and technical assistance requests and for any issue related to capacity-building and assistance within their respective mandates.

- The CTITF e-platform I-ACT should be further explored as a tool to build capacity for information exchanges between countries of Central Asia.
- Sustained cooperation between the UN and regional organizations should be ensured through MOUs of cooperation for practical cooperation, joint plans and efficient exchange of information. The UN should also facilitate more inter-regional exchanges.
- The UN system should produce manuals and guidelines on CT in Russian and local languages of CA countries and disseminate them widely through relevant websites and targeted technical assistance programmes.. The Online Handbook of CTITF should also be translated into Russian and disseminated widely.
- UN organizations need to better synchronize and harmonize their activities as coherence is important to avoid duplication and so that donors can better and more efficiently target available funds. More coherence is also needed between the CT activities, Protocols and Resolutions of the Security Council and those of the General Assembly.
- More coordination is necessary between the Headquarters and field presence of UN agencies in order to better respond to countries' needs.
- Sustainability of capacity building projects should be ensured through the involvement of local experts and specialists and ensuring that proper national institutions are in place and that cooperation mechanisms are institutionalized.

#### **Session 4: Enhancing Information Sharing on Counter Terrorism Technical Assistance and Public Awareness**

- CA States are encouraged to institutionalize the exchange of information among law enforcement, security and border management authorities at the national and regional levels.
- INTERPOL National Central Bureaus are encouraged to use the KALKAN project to exchange best practices, make use of its nominal databases for secure, efficient network of information sharing, and vet criminals through Interpol databases of lost and stolen documents.
- CA States are encouraged to network with and engage civil society and research institutions to raise public awareness of their CT strategies, tap into local expertise and facilitate two ways information sharing between governments and the public. Civil society organizations also need to be empowered, and their capacities improved, so that they could enter in open and fact-based dialogue with States about the effectiveness of CT policies, assist them in

implementation, provide expertise, monitor the human rights compliance of CT terrorism policies and practices and provide assistance and give voice to victims of terrorism.

- It is necessary to intensify and sustain public awareness of the Global UN CT Strategy and its Regional Action Plan for Central Asia. A major public conference for civil society, the media and research institutions should be considered in Central Asia, as should a regional training for the media on international legal instruments, conventions and standards in the fight against terrorism.
- The capacity of the media should be boosted with knowledge, codes of conduct, new tools and technologies to help them engage positively and proactively in the fight against terrorism, including in developing effective counter narratives and counter incitement to prevent recruitment, launching public debates on CT policies, highlighting the plight of victims and monitoring compliances with international CT instruments, including those related to human rights.
- A regional Media Plan with the wide involvement of a variety of partners should be considered to be developed and adopted.

### **Session 5: Public Private Partnerships**

- CA States are encouraged to promote, where applicable, PPPs in the fight against terrorism, in order to develop capacity-building prevention and protection programs according to national legislation.
- Concrete examples of areas where PPPs should be explored to prevent and combat terrorism in CA include: border security, economic investments into vulnerable regions, support for deradicalization and education programs and religious education, curbing the financing of terrorism, countering the use of the Internet for terrorist purposes, such as for recruitment and incitement, protecting the tourism sector and other critical infrastructure, supporting victims of terrorism and protection of vulnerable targets, strengthening CBRN areas and protection of critical energy infrastructure.
- An inventory of different experiences with PPPs in Central Asia should be considered with typologies of PPPs and sub-categories by topics as examples and the results should be published in Russian and the languages of Central Asian countries.
- Enhanced public-private cooperation demands better information sharing mechanisms and the active dissemination of best practices, as well as an examination of different modalities and legislation. International and regional organizations are encouraged to support CA States' capacities in this regard.
- Together with the help of regional and international organizations, training programmes and workshops on PPPs in the fight against terrorism should be organized in partnerships with CA States at the regional and national levels.

## Conclusions and Recommendations in Full

### Introduction from Organizers

The Almaty Expert Meeting on Pillar III of the Strategy was the last of a series of consultations each devoted to a different pillar of the Global Strategy: The First Expert Meeting on Pillar I: *Measures to address the conditions conducive to the spread of terrorism* and Pillar IV: *Measures to ensure respect for human rights for all and the rule of law as the fundamental basis of the fight against terrorism* was held in Bratislava, Slovakia on December 15-16th, 2010. The Second Expert Meeting, covering Pillar II: *Preventing and combating terrorism* was held in Dushanbe, Tajikistan on March 29-30<sup>th</sup>, 2011<sup>2</sup>. The Third Expert Meeting focused on Pillar III: *Measures to build States' capacity to prevent and combat terrorism and to strengthen the role of the United Nations system in this regard*.

Capacity building in States is a core element of global CT efforts. As stated in the opening remarks of Anne Wu of the CTITF Office, the institutionalization of the CTITF, which took place in December 2009, has enabled the UN system to be better positioned to facilitate capacity-building through ensuring coordination and coherence of the UN CT efforts and to bridge the gaps and maximize available resources. The UN is committed to supporting the efforts of States in implementing the Strategy with technical and legal assistance, training, funding, and equipment etc., as was evident during the interventions of various CTITF entities during the meeting. The UNRCCA builds capacity for conflict prevention and resolution by encouraging dialogue, promoting cooperation and confidence-building, and mobilizing, where necessary, technical expertise and assistance within the UN system. SRSG Miroslav Jenča, Head of the UNRCCA Office stressed that the process of preparation of the Joint Action Plan for CA had already created a platform for information sharing, networking and cross-country linkages among institutions and actors not only of CA countries, regional and international organizations, but also neighboring ones, such as China, Russia, Iran, Pakistan, Afghanistan as well as international partners including the EU and US. As co-organizer of the Expert Meetings and funder of the Project, the European Union became one of the key supporters of the third countries in their counter-terrorism efforts, especially through the capacity building measures to prevent and combat terrorism. In this regard the EU has developed so-called Instrument for Stability which focuses mainly on trans-regional threats. As mentioned by the EU Ambassador to Kazakhstan, Norbert Jousten, the EU's own holistic CT Strategy, adopted in 2005, and its comprehensive CT Action Plan updated on regular basis, build upon the four strands of "prevent, protect, pursue and respond". The EU builds the capacity of its Member States in addressing radicalization and recruitment, conducting threat assessments, protecting critical infrastructures, transport security and border controls, cyber security, and the Security of Explosives and Chemical, Biological, Radiological and Nuclear (CBRN) materials. To strengthen the UN system and to enhance cooperation with the UN, the European External Action

---

<sup>2</sup> The Report of the First and Second Meetings are available upon request from the CTITF Office, UNRCCA and the EU External Action Services or from the consultant of the project [tadjbakhsh@un.org](mailto:tadjbakhsh@un.org)

Service (EEAS) has institutionalized dialogue with the UN and its relevant bodies and institutions, especially CTITF, CTED and UNODC.

Discussions on the Third Pillar of the UN Global CT Strategy took place during five moderated Working Group sessions:

- *Session 1: State Capacity to Prevent and Combat Terrorism*
- *Session 2: The Role of Regional Organizations in Addressing State Capacity*
- *Session 3: Strengthening the Role of UN System on Building State Capacity to Prevent and Combat Terrorism*
- *Session 4: Enhancing Information Sharing on Counter-Terrorism Technical Assistance and Public Awareness*
- *Session 5: Public-Private Partnerships*

### **Session 1: State Capacity to Prevent and Combat Terrorism**

#### **Conclusions**

- CA States are worried about the threat of terrorism, compounded especially by the problem of narco-trafficking and instability in the wider region. Concerns were expressed that the transition in Afghanistan could increase the potential threat to the security of the CA region. Building capacity to prevent and combat terrorism as a violent crime is high on the agenda.
- Institutions have been set up by all States to counter terrorism and efforts towards information sharing and coordination among the various security agencies at the national and regional levels have improved. As an example, in 2010, a unified anti-terrorism coordination centre was established to consolidate the potential of relevant agencies in Kyrgyzstan.
- The legislative base has also improved considerably, as discussed in the previous Expert Meeting in Dushanbe on Pillar II. CA countries have adhered to most international CT conventions and are harmonizing their legislation in line with international norms and commitments with the help of regional and international organizations. National legislation regulates the activities of specialized bodies.
- Cooperation towards capacity building has also improved among security organizations at the national and regional levels. Examples mentioned by participants included the cooperation of the state with the public in Tajikistan which contributed to the effectiveness of the recent CT operations, joint investigation teams, cooperation with the Russian anti-terrorism training center and specialized institutions to train CA border staff, cooperation with the OSCE Border Management Staff College, among many such examples.
- Neighboring and concerned states have provided capacity building support for CT. Russia has implemented projects to strengthen borders, train border guards, and prepare cadres of the ministries of interior and defense to work together on

counter narcotics and new technologies. As a member of FATF, Russia is also ready to support countries implement all legislation and international standards to curb the financing of terrorism. The United States is strongly engaged in the region building cooperation on counterterrorism as well as supporting efforts to fight narcotics trafficking and other trans-border criminal activities. U.S. assistance programs help build institutional capacity in such areas as border security and law enforcement, while also addressing conditions that could create vulnerabilities to the appeal of terrorist groups. Iran expressed its readiness during the Meeting to provide technical assistance to CA countries and hold workshops for capacity building and training.

- Capacity building is nonetheless still very much needed, specifically in the areas of border management, law enforcement, justice sector and specialized knowledge to counter the use of the Internet for terrorist purposes and the financing of terrorism. Overall, international and regional organizations need to enhance States' capacity to implement pillars I (on conditions conducive to terrorism), II (measures to prevent and combat terrorism) and IV (upholding respect for human rights in the struggle against terrorism) of the UN Global CT Strategy.
- Prevention mechanisms are key and deserve much more attention by CA States, supported by regional and international organizations. Addressing conditions conducive to terrorism and countering the appeal of terrorism can be done effectively and with less resource if it is carried out in a systematic and consistent manner, addressing motives, generators, and roots causes.

### **Recommendations for the Action Plan**

Strategic capacities:

- The capacity of CA States in developing and implementing comprehensive national CT plans and strategies as well as implementing the UN Global CT Strategy should be boosted with the help of regional and international organizations.
- A survey is needed to map the capacity building work already done in CA which will help in identifying priority areas including needs and gaps to guide future capacity building projects. Organizations should identify and focus on their comparative advantage in the provision of capacity building. Establishing cooperative relationships and recurring dialogues between organizations also helps maximize the impact of limited capacity building resources.
- To prioritize between capacity building initiatives, methodologies such as a risk based approach may be useful. Incorporating measures that evaluate effectiveness of capacity building projects is also important. Evaluation and follow-up mechanisms should be incorporated into capacity building from the start. Long-terms projects that build successively upon each other in lieu of isolated workshops with little coordination or relation to each other should be encouraged, as should ensuring local ownership.

- CT capacity building programs should be conducted within a framework that respects human rights, the promotion of democracy, the rule of law and good governance.

Prevention capacities:

- Capacity building efforts should emphasize support to States in addressing conditions conducive to the spread of terrorism (Pillar I of the UN Global CT Strategy). These include socio-economic factors such as poverty, lack of education, unemployment and political marginalization through developing and implementing comprehensive development plans, targeted youth policy, harmonious religious policy and education, and institutional dialogues to ensure inter-ethnic and cultural tolerance.
- It is also necessary to support States' capacities in addressing the ideological battle. Capacity building is necessary for programs on countering the appeal of terrorism, developing counter narratives and training for law enforcement staff. Counter narratives to neutralize the influence of radical preachers need to be developed in collaboration with reputable scholars, tribal elders as well as the public. Methods of advocacy also need to improve in order to disassociate terrorism with any religion, nationality or ethnic group. Cooperation between States of Central Asia and with relevant international and regional organizations should be strengthened in developing effective advocacy and counter-narratives to counter radicalization among populations.
- Capacity building for prevention of terrorism also requires defining vulnerable targets for potential terrorist attacks; punishing both perpetrators and organizers of terrorism as well as those involved in terrorist financing; preventing and suppressing criminal acts such as hostage-taking, genocide, sabotage, etc.; and strengthening the multifaceted interactions between the competent authorities and international and regional organizations in preventing and suppressing terrorist activities.
- States' capacities should be enhanced in order to ensure respect for human rights and the rule of law, including good governance, in their efforts to counter terrorism and to address conditions conducive to its spread (Pillar IV of the UN Global CT Strategy).

Institutional capacity development for the security and justice sectors:

- National and regional capacities for border management and law enforcement agencies need to be continuously enhanced. Border control institutions need equipment, staff training and technical assistance.
- The material-technical base of CT agencies in CA should be improved with equipment and hardware that could respond to contemporary challenges.
- The quality and specialized knowledge of staff of counter terrorism agencies should be enhanced.
- Activities such as a joint OSCE/IOM project or a OSCE/INTERPOL project in

Tajikistan focusing on promoting biometrically enabled travel documents based on international standards in combination with enhancing border capabilities to make full use of such new security features should be expanded to other countries in the region. If all CA states are to have biometrics data documents, a regional CA system on biometrics should be considered by donors.

- Given that sharing of operational information is sensitive, confidence building programmes are important to foster trust between law enforcement agencies.
- The capacity of the criminal justice systems of Central Asian States, including training for investigators and prosecutors, should be enhanced to enable them to properly prosecute terrorists and suspects.

Specific capacity building initiatives in specialized areas:

- Enhanced capacity in the field of Anti-Money Laundering/Counter-Financing of Terrorism (AML/CFT) and implementing the recommendations of the FATF, including in harmonizing national legislation (discussed during the Pillar II Meeting in Dushanbe).
- Effectively countering the use of the Internet for terrorist purposes, including using new technologies, developing counter narratives, developing norms or standards for conduct on the Internet and harmonizing legislation to counter the use of the Internet for inciting ethnic or religious hatred (as discussed during the Pillar II Meeting in Dushanbe).
- Capacity building in the CBRN area, including getting support for identifying vulnerable areas and for establishing appropriate controls, including through effective measures to account for and secure such items, and effective physical protection measures.
- Capacity-building for proper storage (disposal) of radioactive waste.
- Capacity-building to establish appropriate border controls, export and trans-shipment controls to prevent illicit trafficking in CBRN materials;
- Capacity building for dispute resolution and conflict prevention.
- Capacity-building to design and implement human rights-compliant policies, strategies and practices to counter terrorism.

Exchanges:

- Capacity building measures are needed to improve information exchange and interaction between specialized agencies, as well as other institutions such as border control, police, and prosecutors within the countries and across countries. Cooperation and coordination mechanisms between agencies with the involvement of all relevant ministries need to be put in place and strengthened.
- Cooperative mechanisms need to be developed to strengthen the protection of borders of CA States against new challenges and threats such as terrorism. An

example provided was the meeting of Heads of Border Guards assembled by the Executive Committee of RCTS SCO in July 2011 to exchange information on the situation of borders and to address incursions by the « three evils » through the organization of "security belts" along the borders of SCO Member States.

- Capacity building efforts towards the study of the legislative base of other countries need to be encouraged, through for example the CIS Parliamentary Assembly.

## **Session 2: The Role of Regional Organizations in Addressing State Capacity**

### ***Conclusions***

- The numerous regional and sub-regional organizations operating in CA have an important role to play in promoting co-operation among States and are a great platform for implementing the UN Global CT Strategy in CA. They have experience, field presence, operational programs, the mandate and capacity to contribute to capacity building for the fight against terrorism.
- Regional organizations also have substantive expertise, the appropriate legal framework and mandate, knowledge of the situation on the ground and extensive local contacts. They are effective mechanisms for disseminating information, lessons learned and good practices.
- They contribute to the fight against terrorism by acting as a “transmission belts” between the global and national levels. They channel down objectives, approaches and measures agreed upon at the global level. At the same time, with their field presence and membership, they can help identify needs and priorities of national governments and transmit them to the global level.
- They also serve to initiate pioneering initiatives that are specific to the CA region while encouraging coordination and political will for cooperation among States. As such, they play a key role in identifying gaps in policy implementation and in facilitating tailored assistance and in monitoring of progress made towards countering terrorism in the region.
- Regional organizations also have extensive databanks, networks and secure channels for transmitting of information and have institutionalized coordination mechanisms. Many have developed specific tools and manuals for the fight against terrorism.
- Finally, regional organizations in CA are elaborating cooperation mechanisms through MOUs and protocols for sharing of information and joint initiatives between themselves and with international organizations.
- To enhance this role, regional organizations need to further exchange their knowledge, experiences and best practices. They also need to surmount

challenges related to limited resources, duplicating mandates and competing priorities.

Most regional organizations operating in CA have specialized units dedicated to supporting States' capacities to counter terrorism:

- The CIS is an active promoter of a comprehensive security system and CIS States make a significant contribution to the international coalition against terrorism. The supreme bodies of the CIS (Council of Heads of Governments, Council of Heads of States) have adopted a Concept Note and a medium term program (2011-2013) of joint measures to combat terrorism and other violent manifestations of extremism among CIS Member States. Cooperation among law enforcement bodies is carried out through five programs (to combat crime, international terrorism, drug trafficking, illegal migration and human trafficking). These programs are implemented with the contribution of the various bodies of the CIS, namely the Council of Heads of Security Agencies and Special Services, the Council of CIS Interior Ministers, the Council of Border Troops Commanders, the Office for the Coordination of the fight against organized crime and other dangerous types of crime as well as the Anti-Terrorism Center (ATC) of the CIS. Cooperation has led to the development of the international legal framework for cooperation, joint preventive operational-search measures and special operations, staff training, logistics, information and scientific support for cooperation. CIS States' security agencies and special services have developed a combined databank and are using the specialized database of the CIS ATC towards the prevention, detection and suppression of terrorist activities, as well as investigations of wrongful acts of terrorist and extremist groups. The CIS ATC continuously monitors developments in different regions of the Commonwealth and provides trends analysis to CIS States for their appropriate decisions. Heads of national anti-terrorism centers of CIS States come together on an annual basis under the auspices of the CIS ATC in order to share experiences and take important and concrete decisions.
- CSTO promotes regional security in Central Asia by improving the mechanisms for collective responses to contemporary threats and challenges, especially of terrorist nature. Extended range and efficiency of consultation mechanisms and statutory bodies of the CSTO aim at preventing crises in the first place by political means. It has organized monitoring and exchange of information with Member States on the situation in Central Asia and adjacent regions. CSTO takes part in strengthening the capacity of Member States by carrying out preventive and special operations. These include: "Channel" (Regional anti-drug operation), "Illegal" (An operation to combat illegal migration), "proxies" (anti-crime operation in the field of information). Coordination among law enforcement agencies is growing within the framework of the organization. CSTO is also engaged in the ongoing development of the forces and means of collective security in Central Asia. It has held various training exercises to improve military-technical cooperation. The capabilities and potential of the collective forces have increased due to their equipping with modern and compatible weaponry. CSTO is developing its relations with the UN with the aim of using its capacity for peacekeeping missions under the mandate of the UN, and is ready for constructive interaction and dialogue with NATO on security issues in Central

Asia. In 2011, the CSTO Secretariat signed cooperation protocols with the CIS ATC as well as with RCTS SCO aimed at strengthening cooperation in combating terrorism, separatism, extremism and the financing of terrorism through proceeds obtained from drug trafficking and transnational crime. The CSTO is ready to consolidate contacts and cooperation with other international and regional organizations.

- In April 2010, the UN and SCO signed a Joint Declaration of Cooperation. During the Astana summit of SCO, in June 2011, UNODC and SCO signed a Memorandum of Understanding which included provisions on cooperation between the two organizations on countering international terrorism. At the Summit, the SCO leaders adopted, an Anti-Narcotics Strategy for 2011-2016 and a Plan of Action for its implementation were adopted which also includes measures against the financing of terrorist activities from the illegal narcotics trade. The SCO adopted a Convention against Terrorism in 2009 and is in the midst of implementing its second program for 2010-2012. Capacity building has been provided to the SCO countries, in cooperation with Russia, on joint counter-terrorism exercises, such as the "Peace Mission" series between the militaries, and the "Norak-Anti-Terror 2009" and "Saratov-Anti-Terror 2010" initiatives between law-enforcement and security entities and "Tien Shan 2" drills aimed at improving the combat readiness of national anti-terror units and deepening cooperation among special services.
- The SCO Regional Counter Terrorism Structure (RCTS), established since 2004 in Tashkent, is pursuing efforts to coordinate with law enforcement agencies in the region, including the creation of databases and joint operations. RCTS SCO concluded a Protocol of Cooperation with CARICC in 2010 and has a protocol with CSTO which strives to establish an anti-narcotics and financial security around the borders of Afghanistan. RCTS SCO and the UNODC signed a protocol of cooperation in the margins of this Third Expert Meeting in Almaty on July 22nd 2011 and RCTS is looking into similar MOUs with CTED and UNRCCA. In addition, the Executive Committee of the RCTS SCO has established working contacts with the 1267 Committee of the Security Council in order to elaborate on the inclusion of terrorist, separatist and extremist organizations on the Consolidated List. These collaborations are aimed at enhancing the creation of an effective system of so-called "anti-narcotics and financial security" around the outer borders of Afghanistan, bringing together the intelligence and security agencies as well as the private sector and civil society of neighboring countries
- OSCE field presences are an efficient tool for providing assistance, including on CT. The OSCE's Action Against Terrorism Unit (ATU) supports capacity building projects through projects on travel documents (with INTERPOL) including bio passports, upgrading of technology and training on equipment through the Border Management Staff College in Tajikistan. Counter terrorism officers from Central Asia, who previously received training by OSCE and INTERPOL through Project KALKAN, have made arrests of terrorists using INTERPOL tools. The OSCE Secretariat and other institutions provide assistance – upon request – in building state capacities to address the terrorist threat, and at the same time support business, the media and the civil society. Practically all of

ATU's eight present programmes have very strong capacity building components. From promoting adherence to the Universal Anti-Terrorism Conventions, through international co-operation in criminal matters, passport and travel document security, cyber security, container, supply chain and critical infrastructure security to countering violent extremism and radicalization that lead to terrorism require well established and functioning state institutions, business and civil society, to which the OSCE is able and ready to contribute.

- The OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) Human Rights and Anti-Terrorism Programme works in four main areas: capacity building; expert advice and analysis on key human rights issues in the anti-terrorism context; legislative assistance in drafting human rights-compliant anti-terrorism legislation and co-operation with other international actors working in this field. In terms of capacity-building, the Programme has developed a training module on “Countering Terrorism, Protecting Human Rights” successfully conducted in over a dozen locations throughout the OSCE region, including in CA. The Programme has also delivered, in cooperation with the OSCE Border Management Staff College in Dushanbe, training sessions on “Human Rights, Counter-Terrorism and Border Security” to border officials from CA. The Programme is currently developing, together with the OSCE Strategic Police Matters Unit, a specific training module on the respect of human rights in counter-terrorism investigations. Finally, the Programme is supporting one of the CA States’ law enforcement training institutions in strengthening their capacities to elaborate and deliver sustainable training programmes on the protection of human rights while countering terrorism. ODIHR focuses on the sustainability of capacity building training by supporting the integration of the training module on “Countering Terrorism, Protecting Human Rights:” into law enforcement training curricula. ODIHR also encourages national ownership of its capacity building projects to ensure their sustainability by supporting the participation of national authorities and the civil society in their implementation.
- CARICC has developed an extensive databank, as well as the ability to conduct analysis and training on counter narcotics. It has developed a secure communication channel and cooperates with INTERPOL through its global police communications system, I-24/7. CARICC is ready to expand its mandate to include coordination on CT and is seeking technical assistance and expertise from regional and international organizations (UNODC, INTERPOL, and Europol) as well as states (Israel, US). It has established working contacts with international agencies engaged in CT coordination services in CA: These included a Memorandum on Cooperation with the ATC of the CIS concluded in December 2009, and a Protocol of Cooperation with the RCTS SCO in September 2010.

### **Recommendations for the Action Plan**

Efforts towards implementing the UN Global CT Strategy:

- The mandate, experiences, programmes, tools, best practices and the potential of regional organizations in Central Asia should be fully used in the struggle against terrorism in the region.

- Regional organizations need a road map for cooperation with concrete steps. The eventual Regional Action Plan to implement the UN Global CT Strategy in CA should be the strategic and operational platform under which regional organizations can build consensus and coordinate their efforts to strengthen the institutional counterterrorism capacities of CA states.
- Regional organizations can also play a key role in monitoring the implementation of the Regional Plan of Action under the aegis of the UN. Participants recommended that relevant regional and international organizations create a formal Working Group, a Eurasian Coalition Against Terrorism, which would be responsible for supporting States implement the Regional Action Plan and monitor progress made.
- Mapping should be conducted on how the activities of regional organizations are contributing to the implementation of the UN Global CT Strategy.
- The UNRCCA is encouraged to create a website where such mapping and progress made towards the implementation of the Action Plan for the implementation of the UN Global CT Strategy can be presented.
- Regional organizations may consider adopting their own holistic CT strategies and programs, on the basis of the UN Global CT Strategy, that include not only security-related and capacity-building measures, but also those related to promoting human rights and some of the broader political, social, and cultural issues that may give rise to terrorism.
- Participants proposed the opening of a Central Asian Anti Terrorism Center, potentially in Almaty, dedicated to education and training, including specific programs for rural youth.

Capacity building for institutions:

- The institutional capacity of the Anti-Terrorism Units or Center of Regional organizations need to be strengthened with more resources, sustained engagement and political support to have more capacity to provide assistance.
- The counterterrorism units within the secretariats of CSTO, CIS, SCO (RCTS SCO) , OSCE and its executive structures, such as ODIHR and CARICC need to be supported with more financing and capabilities for cooperation and coordination. The capacity of their secretariats should be enhanced to enable them to better monitor and assist with implementation of international and regional counter-terrorism commitments. Capacity building is also necessary to ensure that counter-terrorism activities within these organizations remain consistent with international humanitarian obligations.
- Regional organizations should intensify cooperation with CA States to improve coordination in combatting organized crime in all forms of its manifestation, including drug trafficking, trafficking in arms and human beings and financing of terrorism. They should also help improve information exchanges and sharing of best practices in countering contemporary challenges and threats, including in preparing manpower and resources.

- Regional organizations should continue providing support to train the personnel of law enforcement and judicial bodies in the fight against terrorism, to help them implement the relevant SC Resolutions as well as the Global CT Strategy, and to support their participation in relevant trainings and seminars organized by international organizations such as UNODC.
- Regional organizations are encouraged to intensify their collaboration with national actors and civil society in order to ensure sustainability of projects and ensure local ownership of their programs.
- The format of the Eurasian Group on Combating Money Laundering and Terrorist Financing (EAG) could be potentially used to strengthen the capacities of the Central Asian states in combatting the laundering of proceeds from criminal activities and the financing of terrorism.

**Coordination and cooperation:**

- Enhanced cooperation is necessary among regional organizations to identify common threats and conduct risk analysis. Formal and informal networks for capacity building among regional bodies should be encouraged.
- Regional organizations may consider institutionalizing mechanisms for coordination through consultative mechanisms, working groups and informal/ad hoc meetings.
- Cross-regional cooperation with other regional organizations should be facilitated by the UN and other international organizations. Regional organizations should also be able to brief the UN regularly on their activities and on developing trends in CA.
- It was suggested that international and regional structures operating in the Eurasian geography (UN and relevant UN agencies, ASEAN, ARF, CARICC, CICA, CIS, CSTO, ECO, OIC, OSCE, SCO, RCTS SCO etc.) to sign a document potentially entitled “Eurasian Coalition against Terrorism” directed to forming a multilateral platform for coordination of efforts and cooperation in the field of CT.
- Practical cooperation on exchange of information requires MOU and protocols of cooperation between organizations. These cooperation mechanisms also reduce the chances of overlap and duplication of efforts.
- A unified guidebook for mutual definitions on terrorism and terrorist acts (an alphabetical thematic dictionary) should be considered.

### **Session 3: Strengthening the Role of UN System on Building State Capacity to Prevent and Combat Terrorism**

#### **Conclusions**

- The UN Global CT Strategy as well as the two General Assembly resolutions that came out of its reviews reaffirmed the role of the UN system in promoting international cooperation and capacity-building on CT. The UN is essential to developing global CT norms, standards and practices and to help states adopt and implement them through technical assistance.
- The United Nations Counter-Terrorism Implementation Task Force (CTITF), was established in 2005 and institutionalized in 2009 to ensure the overall coordination and coherence of the UN system's counter-terrorism efforts and to support the implementation of the UN Global CT Strategy and. It consists of 31 entities which work individually on CT aspects related to their own mandates, as well as collectively through Working Groups. Many CTITF entities have been contributing to the implementation of measures outlined under pillar III including through providing legal assistance, building capacity to prevent and respond to attacks using weapons of mass destruction, assisting transport and border control, facilitating integrated assistance for countering terrorism, protecting vulnerable targets and engaging the private sector. The CTITF Office has pooled efforts to promote in-depth knowledge about the UN Global CT Strategy, produce the Online UN Counter Terrorism Handbook (<http://www.un.org/terrorism/cthandbook/>) and other tools, support regional implementation processes, and set up a data base, the 'Integrated Assistance for Countering Terrorism (I-ACT)' I-ACT as a tool of mapping capacity needs and proving relevant assistance.
- The Counter-Terrorism Committee Executive Directorate (CTED), responsible for monitoring and promoting implementation of Security Council resolutions 1373 (2001) and 1624 (2005), facilitates technical assistance by identifying needs and supporting the matchmaking of donors and beneficiaries. On the basis of reports, updates and feedback submitted by Member States through dialogues and country visits, the Committee prepares and updates the preliminary implementation assessments (PIA) of Member States in their efforts to implement SC resolutions which outline the gaps and needs. The Committee also undertakes the stocktaking of Member States' performance. It has also considered regional aspects for delivery of technical assistance, especially concerning borders. CTED has produced technical guidelines on implementation of resolution 1373 in Russian and is in the process of simplifying the reporting process of preparing preliminary implementation assessment of this resolution.
- On 17 June 2011, the Security Council, through resolutions 1988 (2011) and 1989 (2011), decided to split the Security Council Committee pursuant to resolutions 1267 (1999) and 1989 (2011) concerning Al-Qaida and associated individuals and entities into a 1988 Committee which now deals exclusively with

sanctions related to the Taliban and associates, and the 1267/1989 Committee which deals with sanctions related to Al-Qaida and its associates. The 1267 Committee Monitoring Team, established in 2004, consists of eight Experts based in New York and a support staff and assists the Committees in evaluating the implementation of the sanctions regime by Member States, conducting on-the-ground analysis, reporting on developments that may have an impact on the effectiveness of the sanctions regime, as well as the changing nature of the threat posed by Al-Qaeda and the Taliban. The Team also assists the Committee in working with Member States to update, and maintain the accuracy of, the Consolidated List and assists the Committee in its conduct of all the reviews mandated by the Security Council. The Committee chairs the CTITF Working Group on Countering the Use of the Internet for Terrorist Purposes. SC resolution of 1988 (June 2011) also added for the first time a capacity building mandate to the Committees, and they would discuss proposals from States, including those of CA. They can also conduct training and briefing on the sanction regime.

- The 1540 Committee helps states implement UN SC resolution 1540 (2004) which obligates States to develop and enforce appropriate legal and regulatory measures against the proliferation of nuclear, chemical and biological weapons and their means of delivery, to and by non-State actors, and put in place measures to prevent the illicit trafficking of related materials. The 1540 Committee facilitates technical assistance for implementation of resolution 1540 (2004), including by engaging actively in matching offers and requests for assistance, action plans or other information submitted to the 1540 Committee, acting as a « clearing house ». It posts summaries of the offers and of the requests - with the consent of States - on its website, and distributes the requests for assistance directly to States and international organizations identified as providers of assistance. States may submit requests for assistance to the 1540 Committee by using a template designed to this effect (<http://www.un.org/sc/1540/assistancetemplate.shtml>) or by sending a written request through their country's UN Mission to forward to the Committee. In October 2010, the 1540 Committee adopted revised assistance procedures to rationalize, improve and accelerate response to assistance requests and facilitate match-making; under the new procedures, requests for assistance are distributed to potential assistance providers within one week after the request was received by the Committee, and the 1540 Committee experts conduct informal match-making on advice of the requesting State.. The 1540 Committee can conduct visits to States, at their invitation, to discuss any aspect of the implementation of resolution 1540 (2004), including assistance issues. In support of the 1540 Committee's outreach efforts, UN Office of Disarmament Affairs (UNODA) has been organizing regional and sub-regional workshops to promote and assist the implementation of resolution 1540 (2004). The UNODA-organized workshop for CA states will be held, in cooperation with the OSCE, in Astana, Kazakhstan, on 27-29<sup>th</sup> September 2011 with a focus on border and export controls to prevent WMD proliferation to non-state actors.
- UNODC helps Member States in strengthening their criminal justice responses to terrorism, including through improved international cooperation and enhanced fight against crimes that might be connected with terrorism. Transnational crimes, such as drug trafficking, illicit arms trade, and money laundering are often

referred to as crimes linked to or facilitating terrorism. Since the launch of the Global Project on Strengthening the Legal Regime against Terrorism in January 2003, the UNODC, through its Terrorism Prevention Branch (TPB), has delivered various forms of CT-related assistance, including specialized training on countering the financing of terrorism, use of internet for terrorist purposes, CBRN related issues. Through its Global Programme against Money Laundering, Proceeds of Crime and the Financing of Terrorism, it delivers assistance to help Member States implement anti-money-laundering/ countering the financing of terrorism provisions contained in relevant conventions, resolutions and FATF recommendations. The Office assists Member States with the ratification and implementation of the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and its three protocols and the United Nations Convention against corruption and assists them using the provisions of these instruments to create domestic criminal offences, to adopt new frameworks for mutual legal assistance, extradition and law enforcement cooperation, as well as to enhance technical assistance and training. It signed during the Almaty Meeting a Protocol of Cooperation with RCTS/SCO. The UNODC Office in Central Asia offers technical assistance aimed at improving the management and operation of law enforcement agencies, border management, the judiciary and penitentiary systems in accordance with the United Nations Standards and Norms in Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice and mutual cooperation on legal matters.

- INTERPOL, as a member of the CTITF, coordinates numerous training programmes aimed at enhancing the capacity of States to combat terrorism. Through a special Task Force, it provides a forum for CT experts to exchange best practices, as well as operational information, in order to identify active terrorist groups and their membership, including organizational hierarchies, methods of training, financing and recruitment of terrorist suspects and groups. INTERPOL maintains a broad range of global databases and provides technical assistance through trainings on effective strategies for prevention and response, sub-regional cooperation and assessing the legal authorization for undertaking critical police functions. It also assists member countries in preparation for major events and investigations in the aftermath of a terrorist act. In CA, INTERPOL has developed its KALKAN Project to support States in their CT efforts (more below).
- The UNHCR recognizes the nexus between conditions of refugees and security risks and that these risks are particularly heightened when there is a protracted displacement, impoverishment and an absence of realistic solutions including local integration. Sustainable solution for refugees and other long term displaced is necessary in order to avoid breeding grounds for radicalization and desperate acts. Properly functioning asylum systems assist States to comply with their obligations to deny refugee protection to persons responsible for terrorist acts. UNHCR also acknowledges that asylums systems are not immune to abuse. It is progressively introducing biometrics as feature of registration procedures throughout its operations. This contributes to safeguard integrity by preventing registration fraud. In CA, UNHCR has offered Governments to be equipped with an electronic registration database on refugees and asylum seekers that would include biometrics. In addition to mitigate fraud, this equipment would contribute to improve the profiling of refugees and asylum seekers and strengthen security of

data. UNHCR has also offered training opportunities to government staff in CA involved in registration and adjudication of claims. UNHCR's expertise in providing technical assistance and guidance to States in complying with their refugee obligations and to establish fair and efficient asylum systems through capacity-building is a primary tool by which UNHCR can contribute to the implementation of the Global UN Strategy on CT.

- The UNRCCA, as part of Department of Political Affairs (DPA), proactively engages with the CA States to identify and address existing and potential threats and to strengthen cooperative security partnerships in the region. It builds capacities for preventive diplomacy, facilitating dialogue between countries on issues such as water and counter terrorism, coordinating more closely with the UNAMA office in Afghanistan as well as regional organizations, and catalyzing international support behind regional projects and initiatives.

### ***Recommendations for the Action Plan***

Towards the implementation of the UN Global CT Strategy:

- The UN System should continue bilateral and multi-lateral dialogues with CA States in order to muster more political will for cooperation on CT issues and for identification of gaps and needs. Systematic organization of roundtables, workshops, trainings and platforms for dialogue are necessary in order to identify needs and to help countries apply universal standards in the CT initiatives.
- Capacity building support and practical assistance is needed to help States accede to and implement all universal CT instruments and conventions and integrate them into the national legislations and practices. CTITF could also support Member States in developing their national CT strategies, where possible.
- CTITF and the UN System as a whole should also continue to offer capacity support directly or through facilitating match-making between requests and offers of assistance. However, in order to avoid duplication, better synchronization and closer integration of efforts by UN, other multilateral, and bilateral external partners is necessary to strengthen the region's institutional counterterrorism capacities.
- The CTITF may consider developing a system whereby States are regularly informed of the different assistance mechanisms available. The potential of the I-ACT should be further explored for CA and CA States may consider becoming pilots in this initiative.
- More international support is necessary for the States to be able to adequately implement preventive measures to addressing conditions conducive to terrorism, recruitment, extremism and incitement.
- More sustained cooperation is necessary with regional organizations in the field. UN agencies should consider concluding more MOUs of cooperation with regional organizations operating in Central Asia for practical cooperation, joint

plans and efficient exchange of information. The UN should also facilitate more inter-regional exchanges.

- The CTITF Online Handbook needs to be translated into Russian, it should be disseminated widely and updated as necessary.
- The UN system should produce more manuals and guidelines on CT in Russian and local languages of CA countries and disseminate them widely through relevant websites and targeted technical assistance programmes.

Improving the efficiency of assistance:

- CA States should continue cooperation and dialogue with specialized UN SC Committees, which help them assess needs and facilitate match make tailor made responses for service providers, within their respective mandates. Specific requests and proposals for capacity building initiatives should be submitted to inter alia, CTED, the 1267 and 1540 Committees. The SC Committees and the experts groups that support them could also be approached for help in the preparation of assessment reports and technical assistance requests and for any issue related to capacity-building and assistance.
- UN organizations need to better synchronize and harmonize their activities as coherence is important to avoid duplication and so that donors can better and more efficiently target available funds. Boosting the Delivering as One commitment improves the efficiency of assistance.
- More coherence is needed between the CT activities and resolutions of the Security Council and the General Assembly. The UN Global CT Strategy is a unique platform for better synchronization of UN efforts.
- More coordination is necessary between the Headquarters and field presence of UN agencies in order to better respond to countries' needs.
- As much as possible, local experts and local specialists need to be involved to develop training programmes and manuals to ensure sustainability of project. In general, projects should go beyond instituting national laws to also ensure proper national institutions are in place that effectively implement CT measures and coordinate internally and across borders.
- UN agencies' technical assistance initiatives should balance between initiatives geared towards responding to terrorism and those towards preventing it and its spread.
- Constant improvement is necessary towards strengthening cooperation and coordination between regional and international organizations and the competent authorities of the UN Member States, including information exchanges, strengthening and unifying international and national legal and regulatory frameworks, as well as designing and implementing effective preventive measures at the national as well as at the regional and international levels.

## **Session 4: Enhancing Information Sharing on Counter Terrorism Technical Assistance and Public Awareness**

### **Conclusions**

- Information gathering, analysis and exchanges allows for effective CT measures as well as developing evidence base policy recommendations. Progress is visible on cooperation between the States of CA on sharing of timely and secure information on CT and criminality bilaterally or through institutions such as INTERPOL, RCTS SCO, CSTO, CARICC, CIS and OSCE.
- Institutions such as CARICC have also developed their strategic analytical capabilities in the struggle against the narcotics trade which have helped improved performance and are now developing and testing their own communication tools/information channels. CARICC is actively involved in the collections, storage, protection, analysis and exchange of information in the field of combating illicit drug trafficking. Every six months they produce an analytical study of narcotics in Afghanistan and the region.
- States and regional organizations are cooperating with INTERPOL in using their communication channels AI24/7 for timely and secure information. For INTERPOL, ensuring a modern, secure, efficient network of exchange of information is number one priority. Today, over 141 countries with more than 266 Contact officers co-operate regularly within the FTF. Since the launching of Project KALKAN in 2004 as a component of the Fusion Task Force Project of INTERPOL, cooperation among countries of the region has come a long way in terms of identifying active terrorist groups, and collecting, sharing and analyzing information and intelligence. More than 100 INTERPOL member countries are now sharing terrorism-related information in connection with the Project KALKAN, as part of the initiative. INTERPOL has been able to build the necessary trust to build a coherent collaborative approach to sharing information about suspected terrorists in the region and knowledge of how to use global tools available via INTERPOL to enhance regional cooperation to counter terrorism. Countries are sharing profiles of terrorists and information concerning more than 60 terrorist organizations, using INTERPOL's secure global police communication system to exchange messages. In their efforts to pre-empt, prevent and react to the terrorist acts, INTERPOL is working with security and military forces in Iraq and Afghanistan to identify, investigate, forbid foreign national involvement in terrorist activity. So far, INTERPOL shared with more than 60 member countries, very critical information about over 14,000 telephone numbers found on terrorists and their safe havens and shared more than +2,300 identifications of foreign fighters. Their Global network connects 188 countries to vital global databases including a nominal database which gives field offers access to 180 000 profiles. INTERPOL recommends that States use the secure global police network and global databases, particularly Stolen and Lost Travel

Documents (SLTD) database, the only such global repository and today containing almost 28 million records of stolen and lost passports from 158 countries, accessible by officers at airports, borders and other field points so that they could check air travellers' information whether they are carrying stolen or lost travel documents as basic precautions which might lead to the prevention of terrorist attacks.

- Effective communication with non-traditional partners such as NGOs, academia and professional associations as well as the private sector is important for States to gain acceptance for their CT practices, to receive feedback, to draw on a valuable pool of CT expertise and to engage victims of terrorism in counter-terrorism efforts. As the examples of successful countries have shown, analytical work should go beyond government institutions, and involve media and civil society.
- It is crucial to raise public awareness about the UN Global CT Strategy, the goals and actions of the national governments as well as international, regional and national CT cooperation. The UN Department of Public Information (DPI) publicizes cooperation on CT through the communications tools available to it. It compiles and distributes weekly news bulletin on terrorism-related news to the CTITF information sharing e-platform I-ACT. As a member of the CTITF, it publicizes the Global CT Strategy and helps improve internal and external communication on international CT cooperation. DPI has produced feature videos and documentaries, including one for the Victims Network which was nominated for an Academy Award.
- Kazakhstan provided a good example of coordination on information with the creation of the Ministry of communications and information which consolidates all agencies responsible for mass media and brings them together under one consolidated agency.
- As discussed during the First and Second Expert Meetings, terrorists exploit mass media and the Internet skillfully to achieve their political objectives-- to transmit their political messages, seek political legitimacy and even appeal to the sympathizers to join the cause indirectly. The proliferation of privately owned media looking for sensationalism can present a challenge to governments trying to contain and prevent terrorism. However, mass media and the Internet can be used to develop counter narratives, to inform society and to exchange information and experiences on counter-terrorism, and can have a proactive and preventative role in countering terrorism. Given their impact on the public, mass media need to balance their commercial interests and public interests and be encouraged to make good journalistic judgments in deciding what to report. The media can also play an educational role and offer a forum for public debate on policy to counter terrorism, targeting youth and the vulnerable and highlighting the plight of victims.

### **Recommendations for the Action Plan**

Information sharing among agencies:

- CA States are encouraged to institutionalize the exchange of information among law enforcement, security and border management authorities at the national level. Platforms for information sharing at the wider regional level should be facilitated by international and regional organizations through regular meetings and workshops.
- INTERPOL National Central Bureaus are encouraged to use the INTERPOL KALKAN project to exchange best practices, make use of its nominal databases for secure, efficient network of information sharing, and vet criminals through Interpol databases of lost and stolen documents. Information on lost and stolen documents should also be shared in order to prevent terrorists' use of them.
- The CTITF e-platform I-ACT should be further explored as a tool to build capacity and information exchanges between countries of Central Asia.

Cooperation with civil society:

- CA States are encouraged to network with and engage civil society and research institutions to raise public awareness of their CT strategies, tap into local expertise, launch inter-community dialogues and facilitate two way information sharing between governments and the public.
- Civil society organizations need to be empowered, and their capacities improved, so that they could enter in open and fact-based dialogue with States about the effectiveness of CT policies, assist them in implementing their CT strategies, provide assistance to victims and contribute their expertise. Capacity building for them is also necessary to be able to monitor the human rights compliance of counter-terrorism policies and practices. Genuine partnerships between civil society and governments are key to effectively prevent and combat terrorism.
- Capacity building for institutions that can facilitate inter-religious and inter-ethnic dialogue is necessary so that they could be engaged productively in the struggle against terrorism, counteract the ideology of violent extremism and spread the values of Islam and tolerance.

Public awareness:

- It is necessary to intensify and sustain public awareness of the Global UN CT Strategy and its Regional Action Plan for Central Asia.
- It was suggested that a major public conference be organized with the help of the UNRCCA, CTITF and DPI and other international organizations in Central Asia (suggested in Almaty) on the Global UN CT Strategy, its regional implementation plan and national CT strategies for civil society, the media and research institutions. Institutes of Strategic Studies in Central Asia could be ideal partners for this, given their links with the media and their ability to explain the policies of the governments to the public and launch a public debate.

Empowering the media

- The capacity of the media should be boosted with new tools and technologies so that it can engage positively and proactively in the fight against terrorism. The media should be able to develop effective counter narratives and counter incitement to prevent recruitment, launching public debates on CT policies,

highlighting the plight of victims and monitoring compliances with international CT instruments, including those related to human rights.

- In order for the media to play a role in implementing pillar IV of the UN Global CT Strategy (respect for human rights while countering terrorism), the media should also be educated on the legal instruments, such as a number of international conventions and protocols relating to terrorism, as well as international humanitarian and human rights laws. It should be empowered to be able to monitor States' compliance with international instruments when countering terrorism.
- It was suggested that a regional training workshop for the media in CA (suggested in Almaty) be organized on the Global CT Strategy and its Regional Action Plan and on the measures and international instruments, including conventions and human rights obligations of States in countering terrorism.
- A regional Media Plan with the wide involvement of a variety of partners should be considered to be developed and adopted.

#### Support to victims

- Capacity building projects should be considered for victims of terrorism for effective outreach and development of counter narratives. Victims' association should be assisted and their capacities to raise awareness and interact with the media strengthened. The GA proclamation of 19 August as the International Day of Remembrance and Tribute to the Victims of Terrorism can be used as a day for raising awareness in Central Asia.

### **Session 5: Public Private Partnerships**

#### **Conclusions**

- The primary responsibility for preventing and countering terrorism, as well as for managing the consequences of terrorist acts, rests with States. However, States alone cannot successfully counter terrorism without drawing on the business community and civil society as a whole. By partnering with the private sector, governments can double their capacities while sharing responsibilities and the burden of protecting citizens and providing services. This, however, requires both aligning private sector incentives with engaging in CT strategies and adopting guidelines and mechanisms to make such a form of partnership possible and effective.
- The private sector, as an interested stakeholder, also has its interests and capacities to contribute to the fight against terrorism. The private sector needs a safe and secure environment, transparency and security. It is frequently the target of terrorist attacks and has to bear the financial burden. It can invest in security, improve communications, share information, and develop a common language that can facilitate the development of common goals. It can help protect

critical infrastructures and major events against terrorist attacks, as well as quelling terrorist financing.

- Public private partnerships (PPPs) in the fight against terrorism do not mean giving out orders to business for provision of services. They require establishing a relationship based on trust where mutual benefits are safeguarded and common grounds are built upon. This relationship spans from supporting each others' preparation, protection and information sharing. The private sector should not only be involved when it comes to crisis situations, but rather participate in taking preventive measures against terrorism.
- While in most countries regulatory action has traditionally played the lead role in influencing private sector behavior, voluntary public-private partnerships that shape the risk environment through market-based incentives can complement a regulatory approach. The voluntary dialogue offers private sector organizations an opportunity to take concrete steps to contribute as reliable partners with governments in combating terrorism.
- A number of initiatives were mentioned during the Expert Meeting:
  - The G8 launched a "Global Forum for Partnerships between States and Businesses to Counter Terrorism" (Moscow, November 2006), which resulted in the G8 Strategy for Partnerships between States and Businesses to Counter Terrorism.
  - The Action Against Terrorism Unit (ATU) of the OSCE has organized numerous conferences and expert workshops on the role of PPPs in combatting terrorism at the global level, including at the regional level for Central Asia (November 2008 in Bishkek) as well as at the national level (in Kyrgyzstan, 2009). The OSCE strives to involve the private sector (business and civil society) as much as possible in its counter-terrorism activities and to develop and promote PPPs, in particular with regard to enhancing travel document security, protecting critical infrastructures against terrorist attacks, combating the use of the Internet for terrorist purposes, preventing violent extremism and radicalization that lead to terrorism, countering terrorism financing, protecting soft vulnerable targets as well as protecting and promoting human rights in the fight against terrorism. The OSCE participating States adopted at their 2007 Ministerial Council in Madrid a decision on Public-Private Partnerships in Countering Terrorism. The ATU is organizing an OSCE Workshop on PPPs on Enhancing Tourism Security in 8-9 September 2011 in Vienna.
  - The United Nations Inter-regional Crime and Justice Research Institute (UNICRI) has chaired with INTERPOL and the UN Department of Safety and Security, the Working Group focused on public-private partnerships (PPPs) for the protection of vulnerable targets against terrorist attacks. The January 2009 Report of the working Group was distributed through the Almaty Meeting CD. It highlights best practices and makes recommendations for PPPs for the protection of vulnerable targets.
  - The European Union has experience working with the private sector on the protection of critical infrastructures, energy security, the banking sector and

Internet providers. The EU has provided recommendations to its Member States for modalities and patterns for dealing with the private sector which each country can adapt according to its legislation. The European Commission is develop an EU radicalization awareness network to pool experiences, knowledge and good practices.

- The United States has a National Infrastructure Protection Plan (NIPP) to protect infrastructure and key resources critical to its national security for which it has developed an interagency partnership with the private sector. The U.S. Department of Homeland Security also pro-actively engages private companies in key sectors of the economy to foster CT cooperation and encourage the two-way flow of terrorism-related information.
- The creation of a new institution in Kazakhstan, KAZAID is an important asset for coordination of different donors which should be explored for developing PPPs on countering terrorism.
- The recommendations of the conference organized by the Executive Committee of the RCTS SCO with the ATC CIS in April 2011 in Tashkent on measures to address the safety of vulnerable targets and critical infrastructure provide important analysis to guide PPP collaboration.

### **Recommendations for the Action Plan**

#### Commitment:

- CA States are encouraged to promote, where applicable, PPPs in the fight against terrorism, in order to develop capacity-building prevention and protection programs on threats to critical infrastructure and port, maritime and civil aviation security, cyber security and tourism security according to national legislation. PPPs can also be developed in the protection of critical energy infrastructure protection.
- Concrete examples of areas where PPPs should be explored to prevent and combatting terrorism in CA include:
  - The private sector can help invest in high tech equipment for border management and work out and implement standards and measures to increase security, including border security.
  - PPPs can promote trade and investment into vulnerable regions in order to eradicate adverse conditions conductive to the spread of terrorism. Development banks working in the region, such as Islamic Development Bank, could be approached to invest into security.
  - Privately run media and education institutions, including religious ones, can be ideal partners to prevent recruitment of terrorists. The private sector can provide support for deradicalization and education programs and religious education.
  - Money transfer operators, postal and mailing companies can monitor transfers to detect the financing of terrorist attacks. Establishing communication control over transactions would be an important preventive approach.
  - Internet service providers (ISPs) can be helpful in preventative efforts against recruitment and incitement.
  - The tourism sector has a huge potential for cooperation and is an important priority for CA countries. Vulnerable targets should be protected.

- The protection of critical infrastructure requires PPP approach and the investment of significant funds and training. There is widespread experience among CA countries working with oil and gas companies, which can be useful for expanding cooperation on sabotage of the security of energy routes by terrorists. PPPs can also be useful for the protection of airport facilities, cargos, shipments, containers, and other transport modalities.
- PPPs in the areas of CBRN should be explored further.
- PPPs can also be useful to support victims of terrorism. As stated by representatives from Kazakhstan, Centers of assistance to victims of radical religious organizations have been set up there which provide consultations and psychological support, including through dedicated hotlines.

Guidelines and models:

- In light of diversify of experiences in the region, it is recommended to have an inventory of different experiences with PPPs. To safeguard confidentiality, the inventory can create typologies of PPPs and sub-categories by topics as examples, rather than precise information.
- Enhanced public-private cooperation demands better information sharing mechanisms and the active dissemination of best practices, an assessment of how furthering PPPs can advance the goals of counter terrorism, and an examination of different modalities and legislation. International and regional organizations are encouraged to support CA States' capacities in this respect.
- Together with the help of regional and international organizations, training programmes and workshops on PPPs in the fight against terrorism should be organized in partnerships with CA States at the regional and national levels.

## Conclusions and Next Steps

- These recommendations will be taken into consideration in the preparation of the Joint Action Plan on the Implementation of the Global UN CT Strategy for Central Asia, which is expected to be adopted at a Ministerial Level Meeting by the end of 2011.
- The Joint Action Plan is expected to serve as a policy document as well as a platform for action for comprehensive, holistic, consensual plan among the multiple stakeholders of the region to organize the fight against terrorism according to the four pillars of the Global UN CT Strategy. The Plan will also, among other things, identify essential principles to promote greater regional and cross-regional CT cooperation.
- As stated in the UN Global CT Strategy document and the two follow up resolutions, the primary responsibility to implement the Strategy remains with member States. Member States possess the best knowledge of how best to implement the Strategy given the dynamics, priorities and realities. The CTITF, EU (through its External Assistance Service) and UNRCCA, together with CTITF entities and regional organizations, will support countries of the region in the follow-up, coordination and coherence of efforts in the implementation of the Joint Action Plan.